**Citation Information**

- Journal: Political science quarterly
- Article: Review of Mark Juergensmeyer, The New Cold War? Religious Nationalism Confronts the
- Author: Casanova, Jose V
- ISSN: 0032-3195
- Volume: 108
- Issue: Winter
- Number: 4
- Month: -
- Year: 1993
- Pages: -
- Citation Source: null

**Patron's Library Information**

- Address: Georgetown University, 3700 O Street N.W., Washington, DC 20057-1174
- Email: accessservices@georgetown.edu
- Fax: 202-687-1215

**Staff Note:**

- Paged Locations: 9geor, >>9glas<<, 9anu0, 9uliv, za006

**Holdings Information**

- Location: University Library
- Call Number: JOC SCI PEPS PO 0620
- Holdings: v.105 1991-

---

**Courtesy of Library Services**

For further assistance, please contact your library. NOTICE: This material may be protected by copyright law (Title 17 U.S. Code).
debates and the media are fully persuasive and the conclusions drawn about the impact of campaign themes warrant attention.

This book is written clearly and on the whole nontechnically. But for an analysis that centers on issues and, secondarily, on leaders, it is disappointingly unspecific. The technique that is used seems to direct attention away from the lived experience of the campaign. For example, the third party advertisers that played a major role in the campaign remain anonymous, even invisible. Among these was Canada’s largest national women’s organization, making its first serious intervention into campaign politics. The National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC), coordinator of over 400 women’s groups, developed a plausible, if ultimately uninfluential statement of the prospective costs to women of the FTA. If issues matter, surely we need to learn about the nature and source of perspectives on them.

Four years later NAC appeared conspicuously and more effectively among the opponents of the constitutional agreement signed at Charlottetown. It will be splendid if the follow-ups of this book—the analyses of the referendum of 1992 and the election of 1993—can find a way to report some of the details of the campaigns—including the presence of women and women’s groups among the electorate.

NAOMI BLACK
York University


Leaving aside the misleadingly sensationalist title and the apocalyptic vision of a global confrontation between the secular West and the religious rest, a vision which the author’s own differentiating analysis tends to undermine, this is a compelling study of the recent emergence of various forms of religious movements and of the challenges they are posing to modern secular conceptions of the political order.

The main thesis of the book—the rise of religious nationalism as a hostile alternative to western secular nationalism—is substantiated by empirical studies of religious mobilization and revolts in the Middle East, in South Asia, and in the formerly Marxist states of Central Asia and Eastern Europe. Given the global sweep and the comprehensive breadth of the comparative analysis, the empirical studies have almost per force the character of summary reviews of contemporary trends.

The chapter on South Asia, the author’s area of expertise, offers a nuanced and penetrating analysis of the interrelated conflictive dynamics between secular, Hindu, and Sikh nationalisms in India and between secular, Sinhalese Buddhist, and Tamil Hindu nationalism in Sri Lanka. The chapter on the Middle East
retells concisely the better known story of the conflicts between secular and religious nationalism in Iran, Egypt, Israel, and Palestine. Less convincing is the analysis of religious nationalism in the formerly Marxist states of the Soviet system. The story of the revival of Buddhism in Mongolia occupies a prominent place but is questionable presented as "paradigmatic of what is occurring throughout the former Soviet Union and its client states" (p. 115). The discussion of Islamic nationalism in the Central Asian republics is too brief and undifferentiating. The discussions of Polish Catholicism and of the denominational conflicts in Western Ukraine are even more perfunctory and less supportive of the overall thesis of the book. In Ukraine, the combination of advanced societal secularization and a denominational religious structure much more pluralistic and byzantine than the one presented in the book makes any striving for a religious state unlikely and certainly doomed to failure. In Poland, it was not the collision but rather the collusion between Polish Catholicism and secular nationalism against Soviet imperialism and the secularist Marxist state that facilitated the emergence of a secular and democratic Polish state.

Much of the analysis throughout the book is based on the construction of a seemingly irreconcilable conflict between religious and secular world views, the conflation of the secular state with secular nationalism and public religions with religious nationalism and the religious state. But such an analysis is put into question by the recent role of religion, particularly the Catholic Church, in the demise of authoritarian regimes and in the consolidation of modern secular states from Spain to the Philippines and from Poland to Brazil.

The book offers a complex and convincing explanation of the emergence of religious nationalism in the nonwestern world as a response to the conjunction of crisis of legitimation of the secular state and of secular nationalism at home, together with a global legitimation crisis of western models of modernization within the hegemonic context of a world system of nation-states. But unwittingly, such an analysis tends to treat political regimes as diverse as neutral liberal democratic states, militantly secularist confessional Marxist states, caesaropapist absolutist modernizing monarchies, and oligarchic military dictatorships as so many versions of the secular state and of secular nationalism. Conversely, the most diverse religious reactions to such different types of political order appear as so many forms of religious nationalism. Secular nationalism and religious nationalism are then constructed as mutually hostile alternative "ideologies of order" not unlike the traditional juxtaposition of communitarian Gemeinschaft (community) and individualist Gesellschaft (society) now transposed to the level of intercivilizational conflict between the West and the other.

All in all, however, the book offers a provocative thesis that in its ambitiously global empirical scope and its sweeping generalizations challenges some of the most cherished assumptions about universal trends of secularization and modernization that the social sciences have inherited from the Enlightenment.

José Casanova
New School for Social Research